1st Annual Symposium on College Internship Research

September 28, 2018
University of Wisconsin-Madison

#InternSymposium18
http://ccwt.wceruw.org
Mission
To conduct and support translational research, critical policy analysis, and public dialogue on student experiences with the transition from college to the workforce to inform policies, programs, and practices that promote academic and career success for all learners.

Labor Market Research
Skilled Non-College Occupations

Participatory Action Research
Our Hmoob American College Paj Ntaub

Refugee Populations
Experiences w/ higher ed & workforce

Study of “non-cognitive” skills in STEM professions
A vision: To improve internship programs within all colleges so that they can:

- Be meaningful experiential learning opportunities for all students;
- Provide them with opportunities to merge academic coursework with hands-on practice;
- Cultivate new professional networks and social capital for them;
- Help to crystallize students’ career goals; and,
- Provide a recruiting pipeline for organizations and professions seeking new talent.
Your Phone May Have Been Built by an Intern

Factories in China are using cheap intern labor to staff production lines for companies like Foxconn and Honda.

By Michelle Chen
Research Questions

(1) Does participation in internships vary by students’ race, major, socio-economic status?

(2) To what degree are characteristics of internship programs (e.g., adequate pay, high-quality mentoring, link to academic program) associated with student satisfaction and vocational adaptability?

(3) Are institutional resources and procedures sufficient for supporting high-quality internship programs?
Students who have had an internship

![Bar chart showing internship frequency by institution]

- **A**:
  - No: 57% (43%)
  - Yes: 43% (27%)

- **B**:
  - No: 73% (27%)
  - Yes: 73% (27%)

- **C**:
  - No: 74% (26%)
  - Yes: 74% (26%)

Internship categories:
- No
- Yes
Barriers to taking an internship

Institution B: In the past 12 months, why were you not able to pursue an internship?

- Needed to work at current job: 57.0% Yes, 43.1% No
- Course load at school was too heavy: 45.4% Yes, 54.6% No
- Lack of internship opportunities in my field: 30.9% Yes, 69.1% No
- Insufficient pay offered: 30.0% Yes, 70.0% No
- Lack of transportation: 11.3% Yes, 88.7% No
- Lack of childcare: 5.3% Yes, 94.7% No
Student satisfaction with their internship

How satisfied were you with your internship experience?

- **Institution A**
  - Not at all satisfied: 1.2%
  - A little satisfied: 3.5%
  - Somewhat satisfied: 17.6%
  - Very satisfied: 50.6%
  - Extremely satisfied: 27.1%

- **Institution B**
  - Not at all satisfied: 2.9%
  - A little satisfied: 4.9%
  - Somewhat satisfied: 24.3%
  - Very satisfied: 26.2%
  - Extremely satisfied: 28.1%

- **Institution C**
  - Not at all satisfied: 2.2%
  - A little satisfied: 5.2%
  - Somewhat satisfied: 18.5%
  - Very satisfied: 45.0%
  - Extremely satisfied: 28.1%
Breaks Downstairs
Lunch in AT&T Lounge
Networking Hour in Lee Lounge
Please Hand in Evaluations
Save the Date! Sept 27th, 2019
Research Session #1
Colleges and Internships

Carrie Shandra, Stony Brook University
Elizabeth Zachry, MDRC

#InternSymposium18
http://ccwt.wceruw.org
The New Bottom Rung?
Internship Vacancies, Courses, and Implications

Carrie L. Shandra
Department of Sociology
State University of New York, Stony Brook

National Symposium on College Internship Research
September 28, 2018
Fig 1. Internship infrastructure as multilevel process

- Supervisors
- Recruiters
- Executives
- Students
- Faculty
- Internship personnel
- Administrators/senior leadership
- Colleges/universities
- Departments
- Work organizations
- Fair Labor Standards Act
- State labor laws
1. What do work organizations want from interns?

- **Data:** 1.3 million online internship advertisements from Burning Glass Technologies
- **Universe:** United States; 2007, 2010-2016
- **Measures:** experience, education, skills
Fig 2. Characteristics of internship vacancies, by year

Source: Burning Glass Technologies
...internships offer experience, not training. Employers expect interns to show up ready for work, with specific software skills already in hand...

- Burning Glass Technologies
  *State of American Internships*
2. How are internship courses integrated into curricula?

- **Data:** historical course bulletins
- **Universe:** public/private non-profit colleges; 1960-2015
- **Measures:** year, number, and department of offering
Fig 3. For-credit internship courses, by year and major

Source: Stony Brook University course bulletins
3. What are the implications of offering course credit?

- **Data:** qualitative interviews
- **Universe:** 50 worksite recruiters in NYC metro; 20 internship personnel at 2-year and 4-year public and private non-profit colleges and universities in NY state
- **Protocol:** organizational processes and constraints; challenges and successes of liaising across institutions
Internships as administrative priorities

• Internship personnel described internships and career center programming as administrative priorities, with varying resources devoted to meeting those priorities:

...it was an institution priority. We were tasked with moving the “placement rate” from 85 to 95%. So the resources got dumped into the career center significantly, so we [increased our staff by over 200%].

And you have all the data that shows were able to touch almost 100% of the student population by implementing into the curriculum without taking any of your time. So now your students are more prepared for internships—all of your students—not just the ones who took the time.

- Center Director, 4-year private
Internships as administrative priorities

- Internship personnel described internships and career center programming as administrative priorities, with varying resources devoted to meeting those priorities:

  ...the VP for Academic Affairs, he’s really pushing them and so is the VP for Student Affairs...They want to see the program increase.

  We don’t really have an employer relationship policy per se. We don’t have a person that works on that. We just don’t have the staff to do it...the college won’t let us.

  - Career Advisor, 2-year public
Perspectives on course credit

• Internship personnel discussed how students’ decision to seek internship course credit was often driven by employers:

...employers want them to have credit. It’s not even necessarily that [students] need it for their degree or that it’s gonna transfer back to their school but the employer wants it...

The main reason I think they want credit is because they know the student is covered by liability insurance, number one....And they don’t have to pay them, if they’re getting credit, according to New York State.

- Career Advisor, 2-year public
Perspectives on course credit

- Schools that did not offer academic credit—but wanted to meet employer demand—offered co-curricular alternatives:

  [School] was giving credit, fake credit. So, they would give you a letter that says, "We're giving co-curricular credit", which is nothing. It doesn't exist...So these kids would take a letter there and say, "Well, I'm getting co-curricular credit" so that [company] will allow them to work, and that would get them off the hook for having to pay the student.

  As of January, the laws around internship in the state of New York have changed to as long as you're okay, as a student, not being compensated, we're okay.

- Center Director, private 4-year
Perspectives on course credit

• Internship personnel described employer confusion over the awarding of academic course credit:

Because one thing employers also don't get is it's like, "But I'm giving them credit," and I'm like, "You actually can't give credit because you're not a college..."

You get into those conversations with employers where they're really fighting back, and they're talking about, "But they're getting credit, they're getting credit." Then sometimes I say, "Are you paying for the credit?" They'll say, "No, what do you mean?" I said, "Well, the course costs money, it's not like it's free".

- Center Director, private 4-year
Fig 1. Internship infrastructure as multilevel process

- work organizations (Fair Labor Standards Act, state labor laws)
- colleges/universities (faculty, internship personnel, administrators/senior leadership)
- departments
  - recruiters
  - supervisors
  - executives
  - students
Recap and more questions

• Summary of results:
  – Today’s internship employers ask for higher levels of education and more skills than in the past
  – Schools are offering more for-credit internship courses, across academic departments, than in the past
  – Career centers are often under-resourced and face constraints to facilitating for-credit classes

• Remaining questions:
  – From a multilevel perspective, best practices for whom?
  – How to center student experiences in this infrastructure?
  – How to build effective partnerships, given constraints?
Thank you!

Carrie.Shandra@stonybrook.edu
@carrieshandra
Career Readiness
Internships: Early Findings

Elizabeth Zachry Rutschow
Senior Research Associate
MDRC

200 Vesey Street, New York, NY 10281
475 14th Street, Oakland, CA 94516
www.mdrc.org
OVERVIEW

Context

Great Lakes Career Readiness

Internships

MDRC’s research

Early findings
Why are college internships important?

For Students:
- Teach skills not easily taught in academia
- Help students test out and revise career interests
- Build workplace experience

For Employers:
- Build talent pipeline
- Extra help
Rigorous research in high schools have shown promise...

- **Urban Alliance High School Internship Program**
  - Increased young men’s college going rate by 23 percentage points
  - Raised likelihood of middle tier students (2.0 – 3.0 GPA) enrolling in college by 17 percentage points

- **High School Career Academies**
  - Large, positive gains in students’ labor market outcomes
  - Internship experiences likely driving effects
What are the challenges?

- Lack of consistent standards
- Tension between employer and student needs
- Many are unpaid
- Scaling and sustainability
Internship “gold standards”
(from high school experts)

For students, internships should:
- Offer students’ real, relevant work experiences
- Be tied to students’ career interests
- Incorporate structured time for reflection
- Provide wages
- Offer other supports

For employers, interns should:
- Provide employers with valuable work
- Help further the goals of the organization
GREAT LAKES’ CAREER READINESS INTERNSHIP PROGRAM
What is the Career Ready Internship (CRI) program?

- Started by Great Lakes Guaranty Corporation to provide **part-time, semester-long, paid** internships to **low-income juniors and seniors**.
- Great Lakes provides criteria for participation, such as describing...
  1. How the college will develop new employer relationships and new internships.
  2. How the program staff would work other departments across the college.
How does CRI try to deal with typical internship challenges?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Challenges</th>
<th>GLs’ criteria for college participants:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Lack of consistent standards</td>
<td>1. Provide standards for CRI program development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Unpaid</td>
<td>2. Provide wages for students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Challenging for low-income</td>
<td>3. Target students with financial needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>students to participate</td>
<td>4. Colleges describe how CRI will be connected with students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Meaningful work for students</td>
<td>career interests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Scaling and sustainability</td>
<td>5. Colleges provide 10% of wages in 2nd year; 20% in 3rd year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MDRC’S RESEARCH ON CRI
MDRC’s key research questions

1. Implementation and scale
   How is the CRI program being implemented across the colleges?

2. College/Employer relationships
   How were college and employer relationships built and maintained? What were employers’ perspectives of the program?

3. Students’ experiences and persistence
   What are students experiences in the program and how is the program affecting their persistence?

4. Sustainability
   How sustainable is the CRI program at the colleges beyond the grant? What contributes to its sustainability?
Research data

- CRI program characteristics
- Colleges’ progress reports
  - Document colleges’ experiences developing internship programs and outreach to employers
- Student and employer survey
  - Experience in the program
EARLY FINDINGS
CRI implementation

Most colleges:

- Marketed CRI extensively and made many new contacts with employers
- Worked with non-profits or government agencies, not private businesses
- Mediated the student-employer relationship

About 40% of colleges:

- Provided other supports, such as training in workplace etiquette, editing of resumes, etc.

Some challenges:

- In matching students with internships
  - Developing positions students wanted (e.g. STEM)
  - Filling available positions
What was the scope and scale?

- Many new internships created
  - 88% of colleges had 20+ internships by spring 2018,
  - Over 5,000 internships developed

- Many traditionally underrepresented students participated
  - All targeted financially needy students; 60% Pell eligible
  - 30% students of color
  - 42% first generation college students

- Challenges?
  - Fewer than 20% of eligible population participated
Employers had positive experiences with colleges

- College communicated expectations to us: 91%
- College created internships well-suited to students: 75%
- College was collaborative and flexible: 90%
- College was responsive to concerns and questions: 76%
Employers had positive experiences with interns

Employers likely or very likely to:

- Host additional interns: 95%
- Hire former interns: 76%

Percent
Students gained valuable work experience and skills

Change in professional skills since starting internship
(5 = much more confident; 1 = much less confident)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skill</th>
<th>Confidence Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Know how to follow appropriate conduct</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Know how to meet deadlines</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can problem solve to meet tasks</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can communicate and work effectively with others</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
And many persisted or graduated...

Programs in which all students graduated or persisted the following semester

- Spring 2016: 69%
- Summer 2016: 87%
- Fall 2016: 61%
But likely some challenges with sustainability

Average internship employer funding per student

- **Spring 2016**
- **Summer 2016**
- **Fall 2016**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No employer funding</th>
<th>$1 - $100</th>
<th>$100 - $200</th>
<th>$200 - $500</th>
<th>$550 or more</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>91</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### How well did CRI address internship challenges?

#### Strengths
- Strides in equity
- Interns and employers had quality experiences
  - Signal meaningful work for both
- Scaling successful during the program

#### Challenges
- Tapping all eligible students
- Bringing in businesses
  - Matching interns & employers
- Scaling and sustainability after grant ends
More to come...

- Final report to be published in 2019
- Examine colleges, students, and employers experiences in-depth
- Analyze persistence and graduation trends through spring 2018
- Consider strides CRI made in meeting internship challenges
Thank you!

Dr. Elizabeth Zachry Rutschow
Senior Research Associate
MDRC
Elizabeth.zachry@mdrc.org
(2121) 340-8843

Link to MDRC’s CRI research:
https://www.mdrc.org/project/career-ready-internships#overview
Research Session #2
Govt/Employers and Internships

John Nunley, UW- La Crosse
Patrick McHugh, George Washington University

#InternSymposium18
http://ccwt.wceruw.org
The Demand for Interns

David Jaeger
City University of New York—Graduate Center, NBER, and IZA

John M. Nunley
University of Wisconsin—La Crosse

R. Alan Seals
Auburn University
Background

• Over 60% of graduating college seniors in U.S. worked as interns at some point during college
  • more than double rate of 25 years ago

• Causal evidence that internships improve employment opportunities
  • Nunley, Pugh, Romero, and Seals (2016)
  • Jaeger, Nunley, and Seals (in progress)

• Benefits to Firms
  • Recruiting tool, training, screening, improved retention, and public relations

• Policy questions
  • Are internships jobs, or are they educational experiences?
  • Are there too many, too few, or the “right” number of internships?
Our Research

• Describe the demand side of the internship market
  • Pull all ads from a popular internship website
  • About 36,000 ads
  • Text analysis and machine learning
  • Focus on paid/unpaid distinction
  • Link paid/unpaid status to the regular labor market

• Audit the internship market with about 11,000 résumés
  • Effects of applicant characteristics
  • Effects of internship characteristics
Internship Characteristics
## Cross-Tabulation: Paid and Full-Time Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Part-Time Internships</th>
<th>Full-Time Internships</th>
<th>All Internships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1)</td>
<td>(2)</td>
<td>(3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paid Internships</td>
<td>19.23%</td>
<td>21.21%</td>
<td>40.44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[7,092]</td>
<td>[7,823]</td>
<td>[14,915]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unpaid Internships</td>
<td>51.13%</td>
<td>8.43%</td>
<td>59.56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[18,859]</td>
<td>[3,108]</td>
<td>[21,967]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Internships</td>
<td>70.36%</td>
<td>29.64%</td>
<td>100.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[25,951]</td>
<td>[10,931]</td>
<td>[36,882]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Notes:* The numbers of observations in each cell are provided in brackets below the percentages.
# Cross-Tabulation: Paid and Full-Time Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Part-Time Internships</th>
<th>Full-Time Internships</th>
<th>All Internships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1)</td>
<td>(2)</td>
<td>(3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paid Internships</td>
<td>19.23%</td>
<td>21.21%</td>
<td>40.44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[7,092]</td>
<td>[7,823]</td>
<td>[14,915]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unpaid Internships</td>
<td>51.13%</td>
<td>8.43%</td>
<td>59.56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[18,859]</td>
<td>[3,108]</td>
<td>[21,967]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Internships</td>
<td>70.36%</td>
<td>29.64%</td>
<td>100.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[25,951]</td>
<td>[10,931]</td>
<td>[36,882]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Notes: The numbers of observations in each cell are provided in brackets below the percentages.*
Mapping to Occupations

• Use a proprietary machine learning algorithm (MLA) funded by the Department of Labor

• Ad titles and descriptions are used as inputs in the MLA
  • Classifies internships into detailed occupation categories
  • Gives a “match score”, in which higher scores indicate a closer match to a detailed occupation
Classification in Occupation Categories

- About 90% of internships are classified into the following major occupation categories:
  - Management (6%)
  - Business and Financial Operations (22%)
  - Computer and Mathematical (6%)
  - Arts, Design, Entertainment, Sports, and Media (30%)
  - Sales (15%)
  - Office and Administration (10%)

- Sales
  - Disproportionately paid

- Arts, design, entertainment, sports and media
  - Disproportionately unpaid

- Other occupation categories
  - Approximately evenly split between paid and unpaid.
Occupation-Match Score

![Graph showing distribution of occupation-match scores.](image-url)
Geographic Dispersion: Internships per 100,000 aged 19-25
Geographic Dispersion: Internships per 100,000 by CBSA
Determinants of Paid Status
Occupation-Match Score and Paid Status

Part-time and Full-time Internships

Part-time Internships

Full-time Internships

Pr(Paid Intern = 1) vs. Occupation Match Score
Labor-Market Conditions and Paid Status
## Correlation Between Minimum Wage and Paid Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specification 1</th>
<th>All Internships (1)</th>
<th>Part-Time Internships (2)</th>
<th>Full-Time Internships (3)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Minimum Wage</strong></td>
<td>-0.0251*** (0.0069)</td>
<td>-0.0101* (0.0056)</td>
<td>-0.0573*** (0.0133)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Specification 2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Minimum Wage</strong></td>
<td>-0.0203*** (0.0072)</td>
<td>-0.0139* (0.0072)</td>
<td>-0.0319*** (0.0103)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum Wage $\times$ Commitment to Increase in the Future</td>
<td>-0.0175* (0.0098)</td>
<td>0.0055 (0.0104)</td>
<td>-0.0557*** (0.0174)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>36,882</td>
<td>25,951</td>
<td>10,931</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Labor-Market Experiment
Résumé Audit Study

- Fictitious résumés submitted to internship openings posted in Fall 2015 and Spring 2016 on a widely-used online internship/job search board.
- Limited to men
- 4 racially distinct names
  - Two black and two white
- 6 major fields of study
  - Biology, Economics, Business Administration, Marketing, Psychology, and English
- 24 large, public universities that span the U.S.
- All with expected graduation date of 2017 (i.e. juniors)
- 576 different profiles in each semester
Employer Responses

• The overall callback rate is about 6%
  • 8% for unpaid internships
  • 4% for paid internships
  • 5.5% for part-time internships
  • 6.5% for full-time internships
Racial Discrimination

• Relative to whites, the callback rate for blacks is about 30% lower.

• Discrimination is greater among applicants living far away.
  • Black applicants are more likely to receive location inquiries.

• Academic ability (measured by GPA) mitigates discrimination
Distance, Previous Internships, and Other Credentials

• Employers prefer applicants living closer to the internships.
  • 45% lower callback rate for applicants living over 500 miles away

• Applicants who interned previously are about 15% more likely to be called back.

• No (or weak) evidence that majors, GPA, volunteer experience, or work experience affect callback rates.
Effects of Internship Characteristics

• Paid versus unpaid
  • Callback rates are about 70% lower for paid internships

• Part time versus full time
  • Callback rates are about 15% lower for part-time internships

• Strong negative relationship between the occupation-match score and callback rates
  • Internships that are more like jobs are harder to get.
Policy Implications

• Internships facilitate matches between firms and workers.
  • Happens within and across firms
  • It seems reasonable to promote internships

• What about unpaid versus paid internships?
  • Subjecting to minimum wage law seems risky
  • Would likely result in fewer internships
  • Could harm students’ job prospects

• What about low income students?
  • Subsidize paid internships through tax credits to firms
  • Grants to students
Patrick McHugh
Associate Professor
George Washington University
Washington, D.C.

School of Business
THE GEORGE WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY
Perceived Internship Value:
A Comparison of France and the United States

Patrick McHugh (George Washington University)
&
Ravi Ramani (Purdue University, Northwest)

Work in Progress – Any thoughts and suggestions are most welcome!
Presentation Agenda

- Motivation for this Research Project
- Drivers for Growth of Internships
- Key Internship Characteristics
  - Supervisor Behavior
  - Work Design
- Internship Characteristics and National Context (France and the United States)
  - Institutional Differences
  - Cultural Differences
- Does National Context Matter?
- Data and Methods
- Results
- Moving Forward: Questions to Consider
Motivation for the Research

“A fascinating and overdue exposé.” Benjamin Kunkel

HOW TO EARN NOTHING AND LEARN LITTLE IN THE BRAVE NEW ECONOMY
ROSS PERLIN
Motivation for the Research
Motivation for the Research

Precarious generation
Trainee abused, disguised job!

Patrick McHugh
Motivation for the Research

- Intern Focused
- What factors contribute to enhancing the developmental value of an internship?
Motivation for the Research

- Intern Focused
- What factors explain the intent to pursue employment with the intern-host?
Motivation for the Research

- Intern-Host Focused
- What factors explain the intent to pursue employment with the intern-host?
Motivation for the Research

- “Ultimately, you want interns to have such a great experience that they leave and tell friends and family that your company is a great place to work” — Coby Schneider, Intel Campus Relations Manager

- Intern-Host Focused
  - What factors explain the intent to pursue employment with the intern-host?
Drivers for Growth of Internships

- **Intern-Hosts**
  - Normalization of non-standard and precarious work arrangements
  - Internship as Assessment Center (recruiting and selection)
  - Low cost source of fresh technological skills and ideas
  - Work experience highly valued by employers (skills gap)
  - “Institutional Soft Space” (Regulation? Collective bargaining?)

- **Student Demand**
  - A mechanism to signal potential employers
  - A means to audition for employers
  - Developmental opportunity

- **Higher Education Institutions**
  - Pressure to integrate work experience into curriculum (employability)
  - Rise in pedagogies stressing work-integrated learning
  - Marketing to potential students
  - Financial incentive if credit given for work experience
Supervisor Behavior

- **Supervisor Support**: the degree to which a supervisor values employee contributions and cares about employee well-being
  - Intern satisfaction (D’Abate et al., 2009; McHugh, 2017)
  - Intern organizational commitment (Dixon et al., 2005)
  - Intern organizational attraction (Zhao & Liden, 2011)
  - Intern job pursuit intentions (Hurst et al., 2012; McHugh, 2017)
  - Perceptions of internship developmental value (McHugh, 2017)
Internship Characteristics

Supervisor Behavior

- **Supervisor Mentoring**: the degree to which a supervisor provides direction and feedback regarding career plans and personal development
  - Intern organizational attraction (Zhao & Liden, 2011)
  - Intern job pursuit intentions (Hurst et al., 2012; McHugh, 2017)
  - Perceptions of the internship’s developmental value (McHugh, 2017)
Work Design

- **Task Goal Clarity**: understanding the work products that are expected and the standards by which those products will be evaluated
  - Intern satisfaction (Feldman & Weitz, 1990)
  - Intern job pursuit intentions (Beenen & Rousseau, 2010)
Autonomy: the discretion that individuals have to complete their assigned tasks

- Intern satisfaction (Feldman & Weitz, 1990)
- Intern acceptance of job offers (Feldman & Weitz, 1990)
- Intern vocational self-concept (Taylor, 1988)
Based on Prior Research: Internship Characteristics and Outcomes

- Autonomy
- Task Goal Clarity
- Supervisor Support
- Supervisor Mentoring

Perceived Developmental Value of the Internship

Intent to Pursue Employment with the Intern-Host
Do these relationships hold in other institutional and cultural contexts?
What Role Does National Context Play?

National Context

Autonomy
Task Goal Clarity
Supervisor Support
Supervisor Mentoring

Perceived Developmental Value of the Internship

Intent to Pursue Employment with the Intern-Host
Institutional Differences Relevant to Internships (Regulatory Context)

**France**
- Highly regulated economy with strong employment protections
- Regulatory framework for internships has grown over time
  - Compensation required after two months with a six month time limit
  - Record keeping requirements; name, arrival date, and school
  - Requires tripartite contract between intern-host, intern, and educational institution
  - Open market internship prohibited

**United States**
- Liberal market economy with passive employment protections
- Regulatory framework has weakened over time
  - Paid intern considered an “employee” under federal law
  - Unpaid interns in public and non-profit sector are permitted
  - Unpaid internship is legal in the private sector if the intern is the primary beneficiary of the internship
  - Open market internship permitted
Institutional Differences Relevant to Internships (Higher Education Context)

### France
- Aggressive integration of internships into degree programs
  - Widespread growing mandatory requirement
  - Bologna Process/European Union
- Higher Ed. more centralized and standardized
- Tripartite contracts
- Elite schools have major influence on employment and career opportunities

### United States
- Some movement to integrate internships into degree programs
  - Financial incentive to provide academic credit to internship participants
  - Subsidizing intern-hosts by providing funding to students in unpaid internships
  - Mandatory internships are less common
- Higher Ed. decentralized & variable
- Students can enter into internship with intern-host, with educational institution having little to no involvement
- Elite schools have moderate influence on career/employment opportunities
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>France</th>
<th>United States</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>High Power Distance</strong>: greater acceptance that power is distributed unequally within organizations</td>
<td><strong>Low Power Distance</strong>: preference that power be distributed in a more egalitarian fashion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Intern hesitant to pose questions, seek assistance and feedback</td>
<td>- Intern likely to pose questions, seek assistance and feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Supervisor less participative and more autocratic</td>
<td>- Supervisor more participative and less autocratic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Supervisor may view support and mentoring outside of their role</td>
<td>- Supervisor may view support and mentoring as consistent with their supervisor role</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Cultural Differences Relevant to Internships
(Using Hofstede Dimensions of Cultural Values)

France
- High Uncertainty Avoidance: uncomfortable with uncertain and ambiguous situations and preference for formality to create stability
  - Less autonomy for interns
  - Task goal clarity may be more important for interns

United States
- Low Uncertainty Avoidance: greater toleration for uncertain and ambiguous situations, comfortable with informality
  - More autonomy for interns
  - Task goal clarity may be less important for interns
What Role Does National Context Play?

National Context
- Level of Regulation
- Intensity of Higher Ed. Involvement
- Power Distance
- Uncertainty Avoidance

Perceived Developmental Value of the Internship

Intent to Pursue Employment with the Intern-Host

Autonomy
Task Goal Clarity
Supervisor Support
Supervisor Mentoring
Participants

- French and American students enrolled in a joint program were invited to participate in an on-line survey and then encouraged to invite additional students outside their home institution.
- France: 106 students enrolled in 9 schools.
- U.S. 124 students enrolled in 16 schools.
- Twenty respondents indicated that they had never had an internship and were excluded from the analysis.
- Final sample included 210 respondents (France=97; U.S.=113).

Survey

- Survey translated from English to French using back translation procedure.
- We conducted tests of measurement invariance and found that the variables do not have different meanings across French and U.S. respondents.

Paid and Unpaid Internship Experiences

- 116 / 210 respondents reported both a paid and unpaid internship experience.
- We randomly split the 116 responses between the paid and unpaid conditions to maintain statistical power and minimize the effect of nesting.
Data and Methods (2)

- Control Variables
  - *Intern Compensation* (0=unpaid; 1=paid)
  - *Academic Status* (1=first year; to 5=fifth year)
  - *Degree Program* (0=other; 1=business-related)
Data and Methods (2)

- **Predictor Variables**
  - *Country* (0=France; 1=U.S.)
  - *Autonomy* (two-items)
    - e.g., “In this internship, I had a lot of flexibility in how I completed my work”
  - *Task Goal Clarity* (two-items)
    - e.g., “I was given clear objectives about what I needed to accomplish”
  - *Supervisor Support* (three-items)
    - e.g., “My supervisor at this internship really cared about my well-being”
  - *Supervisor Mentoring* (six-items)
    - e.g., “To what extent did your supervisor suggest strategies for achieving career goals”

- **Dependent Variables**
  - *Developmental Value* (five-items)
    - e.g., “I learned skills or knowledge important for my career development”
  - *Job Pursuit Intent* (three-items)
    - e.g., “I would make this organization one of my first choices as an employer”
Internship Characteristics and Developmental Value

- Autonomy
  - Task Goal Clarity
  - Supervisor Support
  - Supervisor Mentoring

Perceived Developmental Value of the Internship
Results: Internship Characteristics and Developmental Value

Autonomy (no)
Task Goal Clarity (no)
Supervisor Support (yes +)
Supervisor Mentoring (yes +)

Perceived Developmental Value of the Internship

Controlling for Intern Compensation, Degree Program and Academic Status
Internship Characteristics and Intent to Pursue Employment with Intern-Host

- Autonomy
- Task Goal Clarity
- Supervisor Support
- Supervisor Mentoring

Intent to Pursue Employment with the Intern-Host
Results: Internship Characteristics and Intent to Pursue Employment with Intern-Host

- Autonomy (no)
- Task Goal Clarity (no)
- Supervisor Support (yes +)
- Supervisor Mentoring (yes +)

Intent to Pursue Employment with the Intern-Host

Controlling for Intern Compensation, Degree Program and Academic Status
National Context and Developmental Value

National Context → Perceived Developmental Value of the Internship
Results: National Context and Developmental Value

National Context (yes +) → Perceived Developmental Value of the Internship

U.S. respondents report higher developmental value

Controlling for Intern Compensation, Degree Program and Academic Status
U.S. respondents report higher job pursuit intention with the intern-host.

Controlling for Intern Compensation, Degree Program and Academic Status.
National Context

National Context ➔

Autonomy
Task Goal Clarity
Supervisor Support
Supervisor Mentoring
Results: National Context and Internship Characteristics

National Context

- Autonomy (yes +)
- Task Goal Clarity (no)
- Supervisor Support (yes +)
- Supervisor Mentoring (yes +)

U.S. respondents report higher autonomy, greater supervisor support and mentoring controlling for Intern Compensation, Degree Program and Academic Status
Does National Context have a Direct Effect on Developmental Value?

National Context → Autonomy
   Task Goal Clarity
   Supervisor Support
   Supervisor Mentoring

Perceived Developmental Value of the Internship

Or is it really Internship Characteristics that Account for Country Effects?
Does National Context have a Direct Effect on Intent to Pursue Employment?

Or is it really Internship Characteristics that Account for Country Effects?
Results

National Context

- Autonomy
- Task Goal Clarity
- Supervisor Support
- Supervisor Mentoring

Perceived Developmental Value of the Internship

Intent to Pursue Employment with the Intern-Host

Controlling for Intern Compensation, Degree Program and Academic Status
Results Point to Supervisor Support and Mentoring
Accounting for Country Differences

- National Context
  - Supervisor Support
    - Supervisor Mentoring
      - Perceived Developmental Value of the Internship
        - Intent to Pursue Employment with the Intern-Host
One Major Weakness: We Can’t (with our current data) Disentangle the Impact of the Various Elements of “National Context”

**National Context**
- Level of Regulation
- Intensity of Higher Ed. Involvement
- Power Distance
- Uncertainty Avoidance
- Other

**Perceived Developmental Value of the Internship**

**Intent to Pursue Employment with the Intern-Host**

**Autonomy**
- Task Goal Clarity
- Supervisor Support
- Supervisor Mentoring

Patrick McHugh
Moving Forward: Questions to Consider

- U.S. students perceive more developmental value in their internship experience and a greater desire to pursue employment with intern-hosts
  - Do regulations and school requirements constrain French employers in creating a meaningful internship experience?
  - Do mandatory internships increase the likelihood for mismatch between intern and intern-host?
  - Do mandatory internships become viewed more as a degree requirement rather than a developmental opportunity?
  - Does school status limit the value that interns and intern-hosts place on internship experiences?

Should educational institutions mandate internships?
What constraints should be placed on interns and intern-hosts?
Moving Forward: Questions to Consider

- What role does culture play in explaining variation in internship characteristics and outcomes?
  - U.S. respondents report higher autonomy, greater supervisor support and mentoring
  - This is consistent with cultural differences around dimensions such as power distance and uncertainty avoidance

Future research needs to disentangle cultural and institutional factors that may account for variation in internship characteristics and outcomes
Moving Forward: Questions to Consider

- The role of supervisors
  - Differences in country are no longer statistically significant in the presence of supervisor support and mentoring
  - The supervisor plays a critical role – from the perspective of interns – in terms of internship outcomes

Should students and higher educational institutions screen intern-hosts in terms of the level of supervisory commitment to intern support and mentoring?

What kinds of training and resources can intern-hosts provide to supervisors in order to enhance their ability to provide interns with sufficient support and mentoring?
A Growing Area of Research and Policy Interest
Guilty as Charged

“You have been accused of cruel and abusive behavior. Is it true you made your staff sit through a PowerPoint presentation?”

Copyright 2005 by Randy Glasbergen. www.glasbergen.com
Data Suggests These Relationships

- Internship Country
- Supervisor Support
- Supervisor Mentoring
- Internship Developmental Value

- Academic Status
- Degree Program

- Internship Job Pursuit Intent

- Internship Country
- Supervisor Support
- Supervisor Mentoring
- Internship Job Pursuit Intent

- Intern Compensation
Student Panel

#InternSymposium18
http://ccwt.wceruw.org
Lunch & Research Session #3

ITP Sponsored Translational Research Session
Eric Grodsky, Tim Strait, Janice Kenyatta, Carrie Shandra, Matthew Hora

#InternSymposium18
http://ccwt.wceruw.org
Break & Breakout Sessions

#InternSymposium18
http://ccwt.wceruw.org
Program Design

Janice Kenyatta, Northampton Community College
Tim Alft, Waukesha County Technical College

#InternSymposium18
http://ccwt.wceruw.org
This Is An Open Conversation...
Establish A Mission And/Or Vision Statement
# Capture Your Metrics

- Marketing - Tweetable Info
- Quantifies Otherwise Anecdotal Experiences
- Validates Campus Initiatives
- Identifies Students Strengths and Weaknesses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CLS</th>
<th>FY16</th>
<th>FY17</th>
<th>FY18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Citizenship</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>209</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employers:</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acceptable or</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better</td>
<td>273</td>
<td>802</td>
<td>821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty:</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life Acceptable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>or Better</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>7.0%</td>
<td>5.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difference</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>481</td>
<td>1401</td>
<td>1381</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94%</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-1%</td>
<td>-1.0%</td>
<td>-1.0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical Thinking</td>
<td>242</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>660</td>
<td>901</td>
<td>1010</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86%</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4%</td>
<td>-3.0%</td>
<td>-1.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem Solving</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88%</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>629</td>
<td>1105</td>
<td>1010</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82%</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>-1.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>97%</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>354</td>
<td>871</td>
<td>808</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94%</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-Management</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94%</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>323</td>
<td>1177</td>
<td>1031</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92%</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2%</td>
<td>4.0%</td>
<td>-1.5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Know And Understand Your Parameters
Jobs Vs. Internships
Don’t Reinvent The Wheel
Flexible Programming

• Term Dates
• Student Insurance
• Financial Aid Dates
• Summer Internships
• Flex Calendar Option
Building Meaningful and Sustainable Relationships
Start Small
Address the Unmentioned

- Fact Sheet #71 - Unpaid Internships
- Student Insurance
- Workers Comp
- “What if it's not working out?”

Attention to Detail ✓
Employer Panel

#InternSymposium18
http://ccwt.wceruw.org
Concluding Remarks

#InternSymposium18
http://ccwt.wceruw.org